

Dr. Narendra Nath Ganguly, (9435043449)

M.S. PhD, Associate Professor of Surgery,
JMC, Jorhat, Assam.
R/o 12, Jyoti Prasad Agarwala, Bye Lane,
Bishnurabha Path, Beltola, Guwahti - 781028.

.....Appellant/Complainant

Versus

Public Information Officer

O/o Christian Medical College,
Ludhiana.

.....Respondent

First Appellate Authority

O/o Convener, MCI Nodal Centre, C/o Christian Medical College,
Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 2164 of 2021
(Cisco webex Proceedings)

RTI application filed on	:	18-03-2020
PIO replied on	:	11-05-2021
First appeal filed on	:	26-06-2020
First Appellate Authority order	:	10-07-2020

Present: Appellant: Advocate Firuz Khan (On telephone call)
Respondent: Advocate Brighu Dutt Sharma, 9814245156

ORDER (Fifth Hearing)

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 21.06.2022.

Information Sought

1. What was the ground for rejecting my application?
 2. Did you communicate with the RC or the Education Department of the JMC before deciding about the selection?
 3. Don't you think that this selection was arbitrary and biased? If not then explain please.
 4. Don't you think that the trainings are more necessary for the teachers of the treating branches of Medical science, who teach to produce treating doctors?
 5. Why did you choose the other applicant over mine?
 6. What did you mean by Overwhelming Response and how did you decide in such a situation? Tossing a coin? Draw a card? If neither then please describe how?
2. Both the parties are present and heard.
 3. After going through the case file, it is transpired that the Sought information enumerated in RTI application is in question form. Whereas according to, RTI Act, 2005, under Section 2(f), which defines 'information', questions have not been defined as information.

Appeal Case No. 2164 of 2021

Sub-section (f) of section (2) of [RTI Act](#) defines information as “information” means any material in any form, including records, documents, memos, e-mails, press releases, circulars, orders, logbooks, contracts, reports, papers, samples, models, data material held in any electronic form and information relating to any private body which can be accessed by a public authority under any other law for the time being in force”

4. In view of above the applicant is given a last opportunity to file a fresh RTI application for asking specific information within three days from the issue of this order.
 5. To come up on 11.10.2022 through cisco webex at 11:00 am.
- {Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }**

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.



Smt. Kamla Pathak, (8146841774)Appellant/Complainant
W/o Late Sh. Ashok Kumar Pathak,
J.E. Ward 3, House No. 553, Shaheed Udham Singh Nagar,
Malout – 152107

Versus

Public Information OfficerRespondent
O/o Chief Engineer (H.Q), PWD B&R,
Patiala.

First Appellate Authority

O/o Chief Engineer, PWD B&R,
Patiala.

Appeal Case No.4701 of 2021
(Cisco Webex Proceedings)

RTI application filed on	:	25-05-2021
PIO replied on	:	28-05-2021
First appeal filed on	:	14-07-2021
First Appellate Authority order	:	-

Present: Appellant: Sh. Amandeep Pathak on behalf of applicant
Respondent: Sh. Paramdeep Singh (Sr. Asstt.)

ORDER :

- 1.** This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 29.06.2022.
- 2.** Appellant's representative Sh. Amandeep Pathak stated that no information has been supplied so far by the respondent authority in this case.
- 3.** Respondent, Sh. Paramdeep Singh stated that sought information has already been supplied to the appellant dated 02.09.2022 through registered post and no any other information is pending in the official record.
- 4.** In view of above the respondent authority is asked to send again the requisite information on appellant's email and on this the appellant is advised to revert back to the authority in case any deficiencies are found. The respondent shall make good the deficiencies, if the same be pointed out by the appellant and also will file an undertaking **providing therein the factual situation and affirming the position that "the information sought by the appellant has been supplied to their best extent and nothing is due"**.
- 5.** To come up on **27.09.2022** through cisco webex at 11:00 am.
{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.



Smt. Kailash Kaur, (98151 17328)Appellant/Complainant
W/o Late Sh. Dalbir Singh, Village Hardorwal Khurd,
Tehsil Dera Baba Nanak, Distt Gurdaspur.

VS.

Public Information Officer,Respondent
O/o Sub Divisional Magistrate,
Dera Baba Nanak, District Gurdaspur.

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Deputy Commissioner, Gurdaspur.

APPEAL CASE NO. 544 OF 2022
(Cisco Webex Proceedings)

Present: Appellant: Sh. Kuldeep Singh on behalf of appellant
Respondent: Ms. Sukhvinder Kaur (Supt.) 9815212544

ORDER (Third Hearing) :

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 30.06.2022.
2. Both the parties were present for hearing.
3. Respondent, Ms. Sukhvinder Kaur stated that the sought information has already been supplied to the appellant and requested to wave of the fine imposed of Rs. 10,0000.
4. Appellant, Sh. Kuldeep Singh submitted that he is not satisfied with the supplied information.
5. Keeping in view the facts of the case and perusal of the records placed in the case file the appellant is advised/ ordered to **point out discrepancies** (in written form) in the information so supplied by the respondent, within 10 days from the issue of this order under intimation to the commission failing which the ex-parte decision will be taken on the next date of hearing. The respondent shall make good the deficiencies, if the same be pointed out by the appellant.

In case the partial information is not available in the office record then an undertaking/affidavit may be filled in this regard to the appellant with a copy to the Commission without fail.

The respondent-Public Information Officer is also directed to bring the complete original record pertaining to the RTI application at Chandigarh.

6. The matter is adjourned to the personal hearing at PSIC, Chandigarh on **19th, October, 2022 at 11.30 A.M.**

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.



Sh. Sachin Jain,Appellant

234, Advocate Enclave, Sector 49 A, Chandigarh.

Public Information OfficerRespondent

O/o Director Research & Medical Education,
Sector 69, Mohali.

First Appellate Authority

O/o Director Research & Medical Education,
Sector 69, Mohali

Appeal Case No. 934 of 2022
(Cisco Webex Proceedings)

Present: Appellant: Sh. Sachin Jain
Respondent: Absent

ORDER (Third Hearing) :

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 05.07.2022 vide which the appellant was advised to visit respondents office for record inspection, but he failed to do so .
2. Appellant, Sh. Sachin Jain stated that no information has been supplied so far.
3. Respondent is absent for second time in succession.
4. In view of above a **last opportunity** is given to the appellant to comply with the Commission's order failing which the penal action under section 20 of the RTI act 2005 will be invoked on the next date of hearing.
5. To come up on **27.09.2022** through cisco webex at 11:00 am.

{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.



Sh. Jagshir Singh, (8195800345)

S/o Sh. Gian Singh,

9/20, Mandi Mulanpur, Ludhiana.

.....Appellant/Complainant

Versus

Public Information Officer

.....Respondent

O/o Block Development and Panchayat Officer, Jagraon,
Distt Ludhiana.

First Appellate Authority

O/o District Development and Panchayat Officer,
Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No.4506 of 2021
(Cisco Webex Proceedings)

RTI application filed on	:	06-07-2021
PIO replied on	:	-
First appeal filed on	:	11-08-2021
First Appellate Authority order	:	-

Present: Appellant: Sh. Jagshir Singh
Respondent: Absent

ORDER :

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 19.07.2022 vide which the respondent requested for an adjournment and assured the Commission to provide the information .
2. Appellant, Sh. Jagshir Singh stated that information pertaining to point no. 4,5,7,8 &9 is still pending.
3. In view of the harassment and detriment caused to the appellant, Sh. Jagshir Singh, this Commission deems it appropriate to award a compensation of Rupees Five Thousand (Rs. 5000.00). This is to be paid by the Public Authority, in this instance, the BDPO Ludhiana, within 15 days of receiving this order.

Another opportunity is given to respondent authority to furnish the requisite information and also to represent the case on next date of hearing positively.

4. To come up on **28.09.2022** through cisco webex at 11:00 am.

{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.



Sh. Nitin Kumar Garg, (7814322100)

C/o Police Public Dairy 15 A, Shastari Nagar ,
Model Town, Ludhiana.

.....Appellant/Complainant

Versus

Public Information Officer

O/o XEN, Center, Division No 2, PWD B&R,
Amritsar.

.....Respondent

First Appellate Authority

O/o District Development and Panchayat Officer,
Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No.3626 of 2021
(Cisco Webex Proceedings)

RTI application filed on	:	12-05-2021
PIO replied on	:	-
First appeal filed on	:	20-06-2021
First Appellate Authority order	:	-

Present: Appellant: Sh. Nitin Kr. Garg.
Respondent: Absent

ORDER(Fifth Hearing):

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 18.07.2022 vide which the appellant was asked to point out deficiencies in written but he failed to do so.
2. **Written submission from respondent:** A letter dated 23.08.2022 vide diary no. 18781 is received in the commission, the relevant portion of which is reproduced below:

" ਉਪਰੋਕਤ ਵਿਸ਼ੇ ਸਬੰਧੀ ਆਪ ਨੂੰ ਲਿਖਿਆ ਜਾਂਦਾ ਹੈ ਕਿ ਹਵਾਲੇ ਅਧੀਨ ਪੱਤਰ ਰਾਂਹੀ ਆਪ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਮੰਗੀ ਗਈ ਸੂਚਨਾਂ ਆਪ ਨੂੰ ਭੇਜੀ ਜਾ ਚੁੱਕੀ ਹੈ। ਇਸ ਦੇ ਬਾਵਜੂਦ ਆਪ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਪਿਛਲੀ ਹੇਅਰਿੰਗ ਮਿਤੀ 18.07.2022 ਦੀ ਸੁਣਵਾਈ ਦੇਰਾਨ ਇਹ ਕਿਹਾ ਗਿਆ ਕਿ ਸੂਚਨਾਂ ਅਧੂਰੀ ਪ੍ਰਾਪਤ ਹੋਈ ਹੈ। ਇਸ ਦਫਤਰ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਆਪ ਨੂੰ ਨੁਕਤਾ ਵਾਈਜ਼ ਸੂਚਨਾਂ ਭੇਜ ਦਿੱਤੀ ਗਈ ਹੈ। ਇਸ ਲਈ ਆਪ ਨੂੰ ਲਿਖਿਆ ਜਾਂਦਾ ਹੈ ਕਿ ਹਵਾਲੇ ਅਧੀਨ ਪੱਤਰ ਰਾਂਹੀ ਭੇਜੀ ਗਈ ਸੂਚਨਾਂ ਤੋਂ ਇਲਾਵਾ ਜੇਕਰ ਹੋਰ ਸੂਚਨਾਂ ਆਪ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਲੋੜੀਂਦੀ ਹੈ ਤਾਂ ਕਿਸੇ ਵੀ ਦਫਤਰੀ ਕੰਮ-ਕਾਜ ਵਾਲੇ ਦਿਨ ਨਿੱਜੀ ਕਾਰਜਕਾਰੀ ਇੰਜੀਨੀਅਰ, ਤੌਰ ਤੇ ਆ ਕੇ ਪ੍ਰਾਪਤ ਕਰ ਲਈ ਜਾਵੇ।"

3. In view of the above observations, the PIO is directed to offer inspection of the relevant available records to the appellant at a mutually convenient date and time. The appellant is directed to avail of the said offer, failing which no further opportunity will be provided to him.

Another opportunity is given to both the parties to present the case on next date of hearing positively, failing to which the case would be decided on merit basis.

5. To come up on **16.11.2022** through cisco webex at 11:00 am.

{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }

Sd/-

Chandigarh
Dated: 05.09.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.